A STUDY OF CAUSES OF DECLINE IN CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN AT SECONDARY LEVEL

Syeda Rakhshanda Kaukab
Assistant Professor
Sindh Madressatul Islam University
Address: Aiwan-e-Tijarat Road, Karachi, Pakistan.

Abstract
It is being noted with increasing concern that the concept of citizenship appears to have no importance and impact in our education system and society. I consider that this area has been a blot on the social arena of my country for a long time causing negative consequences for the, ever fragile, democratic processes. The field of citizenship education is a widespread turf that includes the aspects of politics, philosophy and ideology and also involves the academic approaches, goals and perspectives. When looked at the most basic level, the elementary purpose of citizenship education has been agreed to be the development of good democratic citizens. Implementation of citizenship education is multi-dimensional in that it includes educational policies, development of curriculum and academic strategies; therefore the expression of the purpose is possible in multiple terms. Citizenship too has dual orientations: progressive and conservative, can be used to maintain the status quo.

Keywords: Citizenship Education; Democratic Citizen; Rights and Responsibilities; Development of Curriculum; Decline in Standards; Moral Values; Civic and Human Rights; Politics.

1. Introduction

Citizenship Education and its transformative potentials for Peace Education
In Pakistan, Citizenship Education can serve the purpose of endorsing responsible and ethical behaviour together with promoting community ties amongst the members of society. This purpose could be put into effect by encouraging the development of citizenship programs among school children leading to create a peaceful environment along Pakistan.

Implementation of citizenship education is multi-dimensional in that it includes educational policies, development of curriculum and academic strategies; therefore the expression of the purpose is possible in multiple terms. Just as in other educational fields, citizenship too has dual orientations: progressive and conservative. At a narrow level, citizenship education can be used to maintain the status quo. However, from the wider perspective it may be used to achieve greater aims by equipping individuals and groups to liberate themselves from the evils of social norms and other backward traditions or fostering the regeneration of the positive aspects of old customs.

The concentration of the researches conducted on citizenship education in Pakistan has been Citizenship Education in relation to Islamic Ideology. This has been done by several
researchers including Iftikhar Ahmad in his book "The Anatomy of an Islamic Model: Citizenship Education in Pakistan". This has mainly highlighted the teachings of Islam and how they should be applied in the society.

Other researchers have focused upon the Educational curriculum as designed by the Ministry of Education. It is surmised that since the 80’s, the aim of the national citizenship education curriculum in Pakistan has been to Islamize the society through means which have led to further confusion amongst the individuals as to the basic intent behind this education. According to the curriculum designed by the government since the Islamic reforms of 80’s, citizenship education has been reduced to meaning the emphasis on Islam as the national ideology within the textbooks to be taught in schools and colleges as well as at the varsity level.

From the initial study of researches related to citizenship education and other review of literature, the researcher has gathered that this education has wrongly been used for solely promoting Islam. No religion needs such promotion and no education should be attached to a particular religion. Therefore, the tone of the researchers and their aim has been wrong in my opinion, as instead of encouraging tolerance and patience (a part of citizenship) it has fuelled further controversies.

Instead of actually providing any solutions to the problem of how to handle citizenship education, the research conducted so far in this field has further created questions. Hence this researcher has found that the niche within the geographical area of Pakistan, in the sea of work performed on the subject is that there is a severe need to highlight the root causes of the declining standards of citizenship education. Furthermore, reasons as to the inadequate imparting of this important education are a part and parcel of the niche. Therefore, in order to fully take advantage of the opportunity and resources available to make a contribution towards the knowledge and understanding of this subject, the researcher shall focus upon the schools and colleges. These are the nation-builders that need to be understood and spruced up.

2. Statement of the problem

This research shall centre upon declining standards of citizenship education in Karachi, Pakistan with the focus on how secondary schools and colleges are contributing towards this decline.

"Citizenship is more than a subject. If taught well and tailored to local needs, its skills and values will enhance democratic life for all of us, both rights and responsibilities, beginning in school and radiating out" (Bernard Crick, National Curriculum Citizenship, 1999).

The statement signifies that the schools and colleges should instil the basic good qualities of being citizens, in fact, being humans into the individuals. The schools and colleges are the formers of the leaders, politicians, social evolutionists, philosophers, educationists and managers of tomorrow. In order to have a better Pakistan within the coming generation or two, it is necessary to develop and shape good citizens who understand the importance of citizenship. However, the paradox is that the very cultivators of citizenship are leading to
its destruction and this is the problem that the research shall discuss and try to find the reasons and causes of.

Why it is that responsible ethical and community minded behaviour is not being promoted in our youth which could lead to the creation of a peaceful environment in Pakistan. The educational policies and the curriculum seem not to be able to infuse the very basic identities of a good person such as honesty, truthfulness and sincerity in the work. This apparent weakness of the syllabus and policies is the only factor causing the decline in citizenship or is there something more profound such as the inability of the impacters of education to provide the exemplary behaviour that would lead to the development of good citizens.

Thus, is the problem then with the teachers and principals of these schools and colleges who are unable to fully grasp the importance of citizenship? It seems that they lack the teaching methodology and strategy that would enable the development of citizenship in the children and youth. But is it really that the proven importance of good citizenship for democracy is unclear in the minds of the educationists? Is this the cause due to which citizenship has failed at the basic levels of education?

3. Research objective:

3.1. The purposes of this research are:

3.1.1. First and foremost, highlight why the overall standards of citizenship are declining in context of proper education in this regard not being provided to the students.

3.2. Secondly:

3.2.1. To determine the level of understanding of citizenship in the teachers who are the formers of the citizens and

3.2.2. Why they have failed to instil these standards in students

3.3. Finally to identify how this situation could be improved so as to encourage the future citizens to develop a better understanding of citizenship education and contribute positively in the society and thus to improve Pakistan.

4. Research question:

4.1. What do educationists and those related to the field of education consider as the main causes of declining citizenship?

4.2. How are the causes of declining citizenship standards related to the school environment and curriculum?

5. Purpose of the study

Since the basic character of this education springs from the nature of democracy, not much need is left for further justification. A smooth and successful democracy requires conscientious, dynamic and knowledgeable citizens; people who are willing to take risks and capable of standing by their decisions; members of society responsible enough to accept the challenge of building themselves and their communities and giving a positive contribution to the political process. This is very important for a country like Pakistan which has, since its inception, failed to perform effectively as a democratic state.

It is, therefore, necessary to uplift citizenship education for which the first milestone is the analysis of those factors that are deterring the positive effects of the field. This study highlights the causes of the deterioration that would enhance the current status of information in the field of citizenship in Pakistan – especially since the research is being
Conducted in the metropolitan city of Karachi. It would furnish an insight into the weaknesses of our secondary schools and colleges; an answer to why they have failed to produce good citizens. It would pinpoint the aspects lacking in the citizens passing through the educational system of Pakistan due to which not only are they unable to contribute positively towards the progress of the country but have also failed miserably in forming a peaceful society capable of supporting itself without external aid. This study would give solid causes of the disappointing role of educational institutions in producing youth who are unable to claim their rights and understand their responsibilities and therefore are unable to prepare for the challenges and opportunities of adult and working life.

The research is also meant to be able to provide the working platform for future researches into identifying ways to promote citizenship in the educational institutions and then eventually develop it into a lifelong process for the people of the country comparable to how it is in Europe where each individual contributes regardless of age and disability till his death.

6. Scope and justification

This research shall enable the educationists and policy makers as well as future researchers to gain an in depth view of the causes of the decline in citizenship. Thus they would be able to bring about a change in the way the youth are educated making them the future generations better than the current and not vice versa. This research would provide a base as to how to inculcate citizenship in youth instead of the way they are being trained to become suicide bombers and leading to the degeneration of the society. Moreover, since citizenship is about the values and morals along with politics and education, understanding of the decline in its standards would also enable to comprehend as to how the moral values such as honesty, sincerity and unity could be developed in individuals. Their current state is that of complete negativity, suppressed and dejected psychology due to which the youth seemed to have given up their love for the blessing of life.

Thus the justification of this study is multi-directional despite its being limited in its scope and focus. Citizenship is such a wide and deep area that the smallest of researches gives an in-depth analysis of several factors apart from the one being researched. Therefore, despite the fact that this research only focuses on causes, it would still conclude by affording a base for unearthing solutions and forming greater understanding of the application of this education within the educational system and policies of Pakistan.

6.1. Defining citizenship education

Citizenship education as defined in “Making Sense of Citizenship” means “… not about trying to fit everyone into the same mould, or creating the 'model', or 'good', citizen. It is about enabling citizens to make their own decisions and to take responsibility for their own lives and their communities.” (Huddleston & Kerr, 2006)

Another explanatory definition is “Citizenship is more than a subject. If taught well and tailored to local needs, its skills and values will enhance democratic life for all of us, both rights and responsibilities, beginning in school and radiating out” (Crick, 1999)

Following are some other definitions of Citizenship Education:

“Citizenship is a set of characteristics of the citizen of the 21st century, given and agreed upon by a panel of experts, including educational, political, socio-cultural and economic dimensions at the local, national and international levels” (Cogan &Derricott, 1998).
“Education for citizenship is concerned with both the personal development of students and political and social development of society at local, national and international levels” (Osler and Starkey, 1996)

7. Methodology

7.1. **Aims and Objectives of the Research**

This research focuses on two key issues: determining reasons behind declining standards of Citizenship Education and determining the culprits in the opinion of principals, teachers and students. The review of related literature already identified that teachers are lacking in their understanding of what Citizenship is all about and have connected it mainly with religion instead of what it really is i.e. a complete citizen-building knowledge that enables an individual to act responsibly in all spheres of life and includes private beliefs. Thus this research is designed to take the work done, one step further.

7.2. **Research Population**

For this research the population was teachers of all of Karachi’s secondary schools including government schools, private schools and madressahs and educationists of Karachi as well as those associated with education.

7.3. **Research Sampling**

For this research the population sample was 3 schools, 2 madressahs and 2 private schools with a total of about 20 teachers, 6 educationists including 5 professors involved in different universities and 1 curriculum developer of citizenship education and 1 student who recently graduated from A-Levels with excellent results and has read widely on different subjects.

The aims in selecting the above sample were those which researchers have identified namely:

7.3.1. **Attaining maximum correctness in estimates within a given sample size**

7.3.2. **Steer clear of bias during sample selection usually replicated by other researchers if the same methodology is used in similar circumstances (Robert Murray Thomas, 2003).**

7.4. **Research Design**

Having looked at the various qualitative and quantitative methods, their advantages and disadvantages as well as the pros and cons of the various instruments, this researcher decided upon the following design for the research.

7.5. **Research Methodology**

The research method decided upon was a purely qualitative approach due to the obvious advantages this method has for fulfilling the demands of the research question asked. The data to be collected was totally subjective as the questions the researcher looked to answer were required a subjective analysis of data. The focus groups and interviews were conducted due to their obvious advantages in collection of data. Observations would not have served the purpose of the researcher as simply spending time in the different schools would have changed the way the things were done as subjects would become conscious and do things differently because of the act of being observed.

On the other hand, interviews allowed the researcher to gather all the necessary data that the participants had to offer. All the questions asked during the interviews were open ended to avoid leading the participants to give specific answers.
Even during focus groups the researcher ensured that an environment of trust was developed so that the teachers would give their vivid views without any fear of repercussions.

7.6. Phenomenology

The method in qualitative research used was phenomenology within which according to Giorgi, the operative word is ‘describe’. Throughout the research conducted under this methodology the researcher aims to describe the phenomena as accurately as possible while not deviating too far from the ground facts. The researchers in phenomenology are interested mainly in “understanding social and psychological phenomena from the perspectives of the people involved” (Welman & Kruger, 1999). Some researchers of the past like Husserl considered this methodology of qualitative research to be very philosophical while others like Alfred Schultz though it to be a research of the survival of the people, the ways in which they spend their daily lives and the general approach of the population to life. Therefore the researcher using this methodology should keep the aim during data collection to gain the experiences of living people who form the sample of the population. Even those people who may once have experienced the phenomena that forms part of the research may be included in the data collection process (Kruger, 1988; Holloway, 1997). The essence of phenomenology was presented by Van den Berg which was translated by Van Manen in 1997 as is given here:

“[Phenomena] have something to say to us — this is common knowledge among poets and painters. Therefore, poets and painters are born phenomenologist. Or rather, we are all born phenomenologist; the poets and painters among us, however, understand very well their task of sharing, by means of word and image, their insights with others — an artfulness that is also laboriously practiced by the professional phenomenologist.”

Therefore, after studying the various methodologies, and wrongly trying to apply grounded theory, the researcher decided that the best method was phenomenological research since this research focuses upon trying to find that causes for the declining citizenship as felt and experienced by the people associated with education. Phenomenology is the only type of research that enables a researcher to be part of the experiences of the individual, to come into close contact with the minds of the participants and therefore, enable an in-depth understanding of the aspect being researched upon in relation to the real experiences of the participants.

Standards of citizenship education in Karachi by collecting data related to the perspectives of research participants on this phenomenon.

Selecting and identifying the research participants

“…the phenomenon dictates the method (not vice-versa) including even the type of participants” (Hycner, 1999). A special type of sampling is used for this type of research called purposive sampling. It is a non-probability sampling in which the primary subjects for the research are identified by the researcher. For this research the sample was identified by the researcher using her judgement and purpose of research. The individuals so selected were chosen on the basis of their experiences and probable knowledge relating to the phenomenon of declining citizenship values.
8. Discussion

8.1. Citizenship Education in the Educational Policy of Pakistan

The educational policies in Pakistan over the 62 years of its history have been inconsistent and very varied while remaining centralized. They have changed according to the changing governments who have all brought their own ideas with them. Along with the educational policies, the civic education specifically in the curriculum has remained erratic as well. Documentary analysis indicates that ‘civic education’ has not received sufficient attention as there is no explicit mention of such provision and the policy texts seem reluctant to use the term ‘citizen’ (GoP, 1992-2002). According to studies conducted in the schools of Pakistan, the prospects of citizenship education in the schools were not bright. Nevertheless, researchers and practitioners continued to believe that the schools provided fertile grounds for advancing citizenship education (Dean, 2005; Fernandes, 2003; Mukobe, 2002; Jiwani, 1998).

The chronology of the changes as identified by KarimPanah in his research indicates four major phases of educational policies:

8.1.1. Liberal market oriented reforms
8.1.2. Socialist inspired reforms
8.1.3. Islamization program
8.1.4. Continuation of Islamization

The liberal market oriented reforms was brought about by the military government of Ayub Khan. It emphasized technical and managerial aspects of an industry based society. Education policy was moulded to promote modernization and a type of liberal Islam. The policy also advanced the involvement of parents and community in the education system. This resulted in the setting up of the private schools as the policy decreased the responsibility of the government.

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto’s era saw the shift back to nationalization and the promotion of a totally centralized system of education. It emphasized on religiosity, nationalism, patriotism and loyalty to the state.

Then the next phase was General Zia’s ‘Islamization program’. It resembled what Gandin and Apple describe as an “authoritarian populist” attempt to bring education “in line with the word of God” (KarimPanah, 2008).

The fourth national education policy (1992-2002/1998 - 2010) came as an extension of the one developed by General Zia emphasizing Islamization of the system, process and the outcomes. The document included 17 point conceptual framework and 15 policy objectives, dominated by the desire to “introduce Islamic Order in the society” and adherence to the principle of “equity, quality and efficiency” (p. 10 & 12). The document puts heavy emphasis on primary and higher education nevertheless, there is a mention of “Academic High Schools and Technical High Schools” while a separate chapter has been dedicated to “Religious and Moral Education” so that “an egalitarian Muslim society” is developed that emulates “the principles enshrined in the Holy Quran and Sunnah” (p. 13). The review indicated that historically, educational policy
in Pakistan has not been consistent and has lacked a clear vision of citizenship (KarimPanah, 2008).

Education for All Action Plan (EFA-PL) document developed by the government of Pakistan demonstrated the intention of “ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning, life skills and citizenship program” (GoP, 2001 – 2015). The policy further recommends educational provision that prepares “the individual and society to cope with an uncertain future and complexities… meet(s) the demands of various groups with an emphasis on disadvantaged section of society”. The Civic Curriculum document highlights concepts of flexibility, equality and respect for human dignity, tolerance of cultural and social values, national integration, cohesion and universal brotherhood, as some of the distinct features of the curriculum frame. The curriculum is designed in a way that it will inculcate among the students the sense of gratitude to Almighty Allah, the feelings of national integrity, cohesion and self-reliance and also the sense of patronizing behaviour patterns of national character. (GoP 2002, p. 4)

The document further articulates specific objectives in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes preferred under civic education (GoP 2002, p.5). According to the curriculum objectives, students are expected to acquire knowledge of the concepts of civic life (No. 1, 3 and 8), ideology of Pakistan as an Islamic Nation (No. 4, 5 & 7) and the disposition to be a good citizen in reference to Islamic society and nation (No.4, 6, 7 & 8). Moreover, the document encourages creativity, curiosity, observation, exploration and questioning as basic skills to be acquired by the learners (No. 1).

Moreover, a number of studies conducted in Pakistani schools show a grim picture of teaching and learning for citizenship with particular reference to teaching of Social Studies (Fernandes, 2003; Dean, 2000) The studies report that Social Studies as a school subject is given less priority, teachers lack understanding of how to teach for citizenship, classroom practice is highly teacher centred and textbook oriented and there is a lack of reference material related to citizenship. The studies further report that textbooks lacked appropriate content relevant to teaching for citizenship. For example, with reference to citizens’ rights, only civil rights were discussed while other topics included the functioning of government and service providing institutions such as police, health department, education department and other such institutions. Similarly, it is reported that classroom teaching did not give sufficient attention to promoting the skills and attitudes required to become citizens and in this regard the studies particularly mentioned that students were not encouraged to ask questions. Few studies suggested using inquiry methods of teaching, promoting critical thinking skills, provision of co-curricular activities and involving students in decision making at classroom and school levels, as measures to ensure that students are developed as active citizens (Fernandes, 2003; Dean, 2000).
It is apparent from the information gathered that the Curriculum of Pakistan has failed to distinctly state the inclusion of citizenship. Combining it with Islamic values and morals is not allowing for differentiation of citizenship education from religion and thus is further isolating the minorities and causing further loosening of the citizenship ties. Moreover the contradictory policy of developing citizens of Pakistan as an Ummah and at the same time formation of individuals who are able to actively partake in universal citizenry is causing ambiguity in the approach to citizenship.

8.2. Karachi Secondary School Teacher’s View of Citizenship

An important research that focuses on the Karachi Secondary School teachers and how they conceive citizenship rights and duties and their importance, is essential to the background of this research. Teachers’ are the ones who have the future of the nation in their hands. They have the entire generation to either develop or destroy and it is due to this that the findings of the research are being included in this research. KarimPanah has identified two aspects which shall be covered in detail below:

8.2.1. Teachers’ conception of citizen rights

The teachers’ understanding of rights is important as it would directly affect the beliefs that they would instil among the students. Panah divided the rights as follows:

8.2.1.1. Civil Rights

This included the importance the teachers laid on sharing of profits between workers and employees, the freedom of speech of citizens, citizens being able to hold public offices such as MPAs and MNAs and all citizens having access to equal level of healthcare and information on government policies.

8.2.1.2. Basic Rights

This category determined the importance that teachers lay on equal access for all citizens to quality education and basic needs such as food and shelter.

8.2.1.3. Political Rights

Here the importance teachers lay on casting votes and forming political associations was decided.

Panah found that their conception seems to be influenced by the way the discussion of rights is limited to the provisions of health care, education, free expression and access to information and other basic needs. This highlighted that teachers lacked a specific understanding of citizen rights as discussed in the theoretical and academic literature. Second, the teachers in their conception narrowed down political rights to merely “casting vote in elections” and excluded the more active role of “contesting the elections” to hold public office. Similarly, the analysis demonstrated that teachers’ conceptions apparently lack understanding and sensitivity towards the “economic rights” of citizens. This illustrates that in their understanding “civil rights” and “basic rights” are more important categories of citizen rights compared to “political rights” as this concept is limited to casting votes in elections. (KarimPanah, 2008)

8.2.2. Teachers’ Conception of Citizen Duties

It is understood that with rights come duties as rights of one individual or group are the responsibilities of another individual or group towards the former and vice versa. Therefore, it was imperative that the researcher would follow
teachers’ understanding of citizen rights with their understanding of duties. The following duties were identified and questioned:

8.2.2.1. Socio-religious duties

This aspect covered the importance of following religious duties, observing religious rites, paying Zakat (religious taxes) and government taxes and helping others around them in need.

Socio-participatory duties

It encompassed the significance of that teachers laid upon the duties of individuals meeting family’s basic needs, working along with others in the locality to solve local problems, obeying traffic rules and contributing to NGOs working for social welfare such as Edhi Foundation.

8.2.2.2. Politico-communitarian duties

These consisted of willingness to stand in public office, serving one’s community, willingness to serve in the army in case of a war and taking part in rallies to support a cause.

Regarding teachers’ conceptions of the responsibilities of citizens, the study demonstrates a lack of logical understanding as identified factors overlapped in terms of the items grouped in each factor. The identified factors largely carry social and religious values reflected in civility, patriotism and submission as understood in the traditional meaning of the terms. The results demonstrate that teachers in their conception focused individuals’ private responsibilities as relevant to their immediate locality whilst a lesser degree of importance was given to responsibilities of a political nature to be performed in the public sphere (Kymlicka, 2003; Janoski, 1998). This also corresponds with the emphasis in teachers’ conceptions of citizen rights on civility and rights relating to private life. However, the most interesting aspect of the results is the contradiction in teachers’ conception of “political rights” wherein “willing to hold public office and participating in rallies” have only been identified as the responsibility of citizens but not as political rights. This indicates that teachers either lacked understanding of “political rights and responsibilities” or did not pay serious attention to the concept of citizenship (KarimPanah, 2008).

It is important that Civic education in particular and education in general at both policy and operational level need to offer more on citizenship and political literacy. Citizenship should be understood by teachers to be active and equal membership of an independent state and not just a subject that teaches loyalty to the country and the government. The education that students receive in schools and their time spent at school should be such so as to develop an understanding among them about the rights and duties that they have as responsible and active citizens of the country. Theirs should be an education that allows them to be moderate nationals of the country (KarimPanah, 2008).

9. Data analysis and findings of the study

The data analysis, which follows, is mainly through the qualitative analysis technique of Phenomenology. The analysis of 7 interviews and 3 focus groups was analyzed in detail. The research revealed the following findings.
Along with the analysis of the primary data, the researcher has continuously upgraded the research analysis with information from secondary sources, mainly newspapers, to bring to light the current and latest aspects being thought out and written on this issue.

The researcher conducted two interviews to begin the data analysis procedure. There was one aspect identified by only one of the participants in the initial session during which interviews were individually conducted with the participants. However, the researcher considers this an important aspect as the interviewee is a person of insight with over 40 years of association with teaching and over 15 years of experience with research. Later on though, this area was further discussed by certain teachers during the focus groups.

9.1. National Ideology

The interviewee suggested that the peak of good citizenry and widespread belief in good citizenship was during the decade before and after the partition of Pakistan. During this era the belief in unity and a sense of national interest was widespread. People believed that the active participation in social affairs was the only way through which the cultures, beliefs and values of both the Muslims and Hindus could survive. Otherwise, the majority would have dominated over the minority or else the British Government would not have left. This sense of purpose and direction provided the people of the Subcontinent in the areas that formed Pakistan, the values, norms and political insight to be good citizens, which continued to exist in Pakistan for a decade or so. Since then the decline has set in. The decline we see in Karachi is part of the one we observe in the whole country and it is due to the lack of love for the country and absence of the sense of direction in the youth.

9.2. Findings of the Study

The researcher inferred that this meant that the students of the secondary school had no real ideology which would define citizenship for them. For each country, the citizenry values differ according to the aims and ideas that direct one's goals, expectations, and actions. For example, in Germany the development of citizenship education was based on “the development of democratic schools.... future citizens of Germany need to experience a curriculum which develops students’ sense of participation in decision-making and political processes” (Cogan & Derricott, 1998). This was to serve against the harms done by the Second World War and the communist forces. Similarly, in Pakistan the citizenship education has to be based upon our traditions to be successful which, so far, has not been done.
9.2.1. National ideology played an important role in the creation of Pakistan and was the basic reason for the existence of good citizenry among the ancestors of the current generation in Pakistan. As the focus, understanding and importance has decreased for the youth today, therefore, this has had its effects on all the citizens of Pakistan including the students of the secondary schools. Since students are part of the environment, therefore, the decline in citizenship education is visible in the secondary schools of Karachi.

9.2.2. Moreover, the virtual non-existence of inspirational leadership within the country builds up national frustration that shows up in people of all walks of life including the teachers who take it with them in the schools and classes. This same frustration is then transferred to the students due to the negative comments of teachers regarding our leadership while they praise the west.

9.2.3. Media is another broad factor causing lack of citizenship at secondary levels. The students at this level watch a lot of television, especially since Karachi being the most developed city of Pakistan being a metropolitan, the negative role of media becomes multiplied. It occurs in the form of imitation by children of the immoral and villainous acts they see on the media ranging from the news items showing adult content to a very detailed extent and the films, movies and dramas too depicting the culture and values that are not in synchronization with the Pakistani values.

9.2.4. In this broad category, the final element was the role of NGOs which both, directly and indirectly, causes the decline in citizenship education at the secondary level in Karachi. The NGOs do not specifically address the issues of the students of Karachi and their needs; rather they try to apply the standards defined in a controlled and ideal environment developed in the western, advanced societies. These standards are usually mismatched with the situation existent in Karachi. Therefore, they further the decrease in citizenry.

9.2.5. Secondly, the factors specifically relating to the schools was identified which could be projected to the secondary schools in general in Karachi to a certain degree. They are not completely projectable because of the differences in education systems that were identified during the research. The factors include the lack of training amongst teachers, low monetary returns and materialism; theoretical approach of teaching citizenship, the problems within government schools and the harmful effects of society.

9.2.6. The teachers are faced with tough decisions due to the low returns they receive from teaching. In order to satisfy the basic needs of family they are unable to give time to the students of one institute as they work simultaneously in several places and also give tuitions. Moreover, materialism is also prevalent in the schools as education has become a money-making enterprise and is no longer considered a moral duty of the educated. Therefore, due to differing reasons most teachers and many educational institutes at secondary level are not interested in providing quality education and going beyond the normal meaning of a teacher of the syllabus and involving themselves in the citizenship education of their students. Also the teachers are not the role models they should be, which is causing negligible practical learning of the students in the field of citizenry.
9.2.7. Also just including chapters in the syllabus and merely providing for this education in the curriculum is not enough. Reading does not enable the practical application and understanding of moral values and different aspects of citizenry. Interactive discussions on citizenship are lacking in the schools as these discussions cause insight into the practicality of citizenry and its moral, political and social aspects to develop. Its existence as a distinct subject comes to light only when it would be taught and discussed separately from the other subjects but at the same time it is the responsibility of all the teachers.

9.2.8. Then within some systems, rote-learning is encouraged which doesn’t develop the application and evaluation abilities thus not enabling the understanding of the right and wrongs in society.

9.2.9. The government schools in particular have several faults, where the majority of the students study. There is the divided approach towards corporal punishment. Schools which are practicing it are stopped by the different groups to stop and those that are prevented have teachers complaining of not being allowed to practice it even on the students who lie habitually and cheat as well. The lack of age limits for different classes and no separate classrooms for older students, who due to their economic conditions or any other reasons begin school late, also causes problems like bullying, disregard for rules and others.

9.2.10. Then there are further causes that the society contributes which are also causing decline of citizenship such as strikes and holidays and emigration of the talented students. Citizenship education is a lifelong interactive process which should not stop at any stage.

10. Conclusion
This entire research could be broadly referred to as a theory development exercise. Right from the introduction to literature review to data collection and analysis, the researcher worked towards the development of a specific theory for the answer to the research questions raised. The research served its purpose as an attempt to further the citizenship education in Karachi schools, an area much neglected by the Pakistani researchers in education. The status of this research is that of the identification of the factors, both broad and specific which have led to the decline in the citizenship education in the secondary schools of Karachi.
References


